

the competition prize pipe in 1817. Three of his sons, also, were pipers, and their competition careers can be summarised as follows:

TABLE IV/(10). Donald MacDonald and Sons: Competition Record

	DONALD Snr.	JOHN	DONALD Jnr.	JAMES
YEARS COMPETING	1801; 1806-9; 1811, 12; 1817-20	1806-1811	1819-1826	1819-22; 1826
5th Prize	-	-	1821	1820
4th Prize	-	-	1823	-
3rd Prize	1801	1806	1824	1826
2nd Prize	1811	-	1826	-
1st Prize	1817	-	-	-
Addi- tional Info. from Records	1801 Caithness Fencibles 1806-9 Pipe- Maker 1811-20 P/M Argyllshire Militia	1810, 11 Argyll- shire Militia	1825, 26 72nd Reg't.	

Source: Competition Records

In Edinburgh Donald set up as a pipe maker at 529 Castle Hill. There is every possibility, in fact, that he inherited his business from the old and established pipemaker, Hugh Robertson, who also had premises on the Castle Hill. It is known, for instance, that Robertson still had the commission for the competition prize pipe in 1818, when he was 88 years old, which strongly suggests that he then had an assistant. [HSL 268: 19]. MacDonald was awarded the prize pipe commission in 1821 (when Robertson was in ill-health [HSS Sd. Bk. 6: 341]), and continued to make the prize pipe until his death in 1840.

These years represent his hey-day as a pipe maker when, although himself in advanced years, his pipes enjoyed wide favour. He advertised himself as a teacher of "the Great Highland, Northumberland and Irish bagpipes" [1820: title page], and museum specimens show that he made all these instruments, plus several varieties of Scottish small pipes, bellows-blown and otherwise. [Cheape 1983(a), (b)].

In February 1823, with the patronage of Sir John Sinclair, he was appointed official pipe maker to the Highland Societies, which title he used in his unpublished pibroch manuscript (1826), and in later editions of his published collection (but not the 1st edition, which confirms this to predate 1823). [HSL 268, 27: 1/2/1823; Edinb. & Leith P.O. Directory, 1824-5].

Conventionally his published collection has been dated to c.1822 [vide Cannon 1980: 118], but I would suggest c. 1820 to be a more realistic date, on the following evidence:

- (1) The 1819 competition accounts contain an entry for

"sum subscribed for five copies of a collection of piobaireachd to be immediately pub. by Don. MacDonald, £5.5.0". [Kilberry I: 51].

- (2) Two pieces of correspondence between the secretaries of the London and Scottish Societies in 1821 mention the collection. On 15 Feb. 1821 John Wedderburn, the London Secretary, sought Charles Gordon's "opinion in D. MacDonald's book". [Kilberry II: 3]. On 4 Aug. 1821 Charles Gordon recorded that a good many tunes



had been produced at the Edinburgh competition "several of them not in MacDonald's collection". [HSL 268, 19: Letter 4/8/1821].

- (3) Just prior to the King's visit to Edinburgh in August 1822 an advertisement appeared in the Caledonian Mercury for a 3d Edition of MacDonald's Collection. [Cal Merc July 29 1822].

- (4) The first time the tune title The Finger Lock appeared in print was in MacDonald's collection. The first time this title was used at the Edinburgh competitions was in July 1821. Prior to then the tune (known in Gaelic as A Ghlas Mheur (12)) had been entered numerous times, but had been described in English simply as a "favourite", "capital" or "principal" piece. In 1784, indeed, the tune was used as a test piece, being "a much admired composition, but difficult of execution". [Scots Mag. 46 (Oct. 1784): 552]. The tune was recorded twice prior to MacDonald (by Patrick MacDonald (1784) and in the Campbell Canntaireachd (1797)), but in neither record does it have an English title. This evidence strongly suggests that MacDonald in fact coined the English title The Finger Lock (a literal translation of the Gaelic), and that it was through his collection that the title was popularised at the Edinburgh competition. This would support the notion that his

collection was published prior to July 1821.

## Notation

In his preface to the published collection Macdonald acknowledged that he had been

"encouraged by a prize from the Highland Society of Scotland, as being the first who had succeeded in setting the pibroch to music". [Macdonald D. 1820:3].

This was a reference to his notation award of 5 guineas in 1806. He also stated that he had "sacrificed the leisure moments of the last fifteen years" in compiling the work [1820: ibid.], from which we can deduce that he commenced the task in about 1805. There is a strong likelihood that he would have had access to Joseph Macdonald's Compleat Theory (copies of which were distributed at the 1804 competition), which, despite its defects, would have been a useful starting point for any would-be notator. (We can possibly detect a veiled reference to the Compleat Theory in his remark on pipe music notation "hitherto unattempted, or at least, unaccomplished". [1820: 1]). There is also every likelihood that he would have taken some time to evolve a reasonably consistent notation style, given that he was one of the first in the field, and there is in fact a manuscript in the National Library of Scotland, known as the Hannay/MacAulian MS [c.1811-1819, NLS Dep. 201], which Buisman has identified as a likely early specimen of his



work. [Buisman 1985(a)].

His most enduring legacy was in the creation of a simple and effective way of separating-out gracenotes from melody notes on the printed page. He simply wrote the stems of all melody notes downwards (unlike conventional notation), and wrote the gracenotes with smaller heads and upward-pointing stems. This meant that melody notes could be grouped as rhythm required, without interference from the gracenote stems, hence avoiding the problems evident in Joseph MacDonald's volume. He wrote all his gracenotes of equal value (as demi-semi-quavers), and his work is characterised by a variety and subtlety of gracenoting which is not evinced in the work of his successor, Angus MacKay, who made a clear effort to rationalize the gracing system. Specific examples of the differences between the two in this respect are illustrated later in the chapter.

MacDonald's notation style is probably representative of the playing of an older generation of pipers who grew up in the mid to late eighteenth century. Other early sources written by pipers of the same vintage, such as Joseph MacDonald (1760) and Angus MacArthur (1820), exhibit many similarities, and on the whole diverge noticeably from the style later popularised by Angus MacKay, a piper born in 1813.

Modern detractors of MacDonald's style [e.g. Campbell J. 1988: 24] have tried to explain notational differences between MacDonald and MacKay by pointing to MacDonald's professed intention to accommodate other musicians. The

implication is that MacDonald did not in fact represent true bagpipe notation, but rather a product diluted to the requirements of other instruments. This is a flimsy argument which fails on three counts: firstly, MacDonald's notation is in fact more elaborate than MacKay's, and for that reason would have been, if anything, less accessible to other musicians; secondly, other pre-MacKay sources which are compatible with MacDonald (e.g. MacArthur, Reid), were not written for non-pipers; and thirdly, MacKay himself advertised his collection as "adapted to the piano". [MacKay 1838: title page]. In fact there is no evidence that either collection sacrificed musical content to the needs of non-pipers. There are many examples of pibrochs actually adapted to the keyboard [e.g.. Dow (1778), P. MacDonald (1784), E. Ross (1812), A. Campbell (1816)], and none of these show the intricate pipe gracings contained in the scores of MacDonald and MacKay. The inescapable fact is that the music notated by MacDonald represented an actual playing style which once had wide currency. The fact that it was slightly different from the music later notated by MacKay (which forms the basis of our modern playing style), should not be allowed to obscure the value of MacDonald's work.

MacDonald recorded that the tunes in his published volume formed "only a small part [of] those the publisher has arranged and collected" [1820: 5], and by 1826 he had written-out in detailed proof a further 48 tunes, ready for publication. [MacDonald D: 1826]. When financial



constraints forced him to abandon plans for publication, he sent this manuscript to an old pupil, W.J. Grant of Elchies, in India, who in turn passed it to his grandson, General C.S. Thomason. Thomason used the manuscript in compiling his compendious collection of Ceòl Mòr in 1900. [Thomason 1900(a): ii; 1900(b): 83]. Another notation scheme which MacDonald had underway was a collection of 119 quicksteps, strathspeys, reels and jigs, which he published in 1828 - the first of its type. The preface recorded that

"The present work has been finished for several years, and has been so long withheld, owing to the publisher's diffidence regarding his own abilities."

[MacDonald 1828: preface].

In fact in this, as with the pibroch notation, MacDonald was a trend-setter, and this volume presaged a flood of light music publishing as the century progressed.

He died in October 1840, aged 91, and "his effects went to the hammer for the benefit of some charities". [MacGregor A 1878: 466]. The HSS provided two of his widowed daughters (in "destitute circumstances") with a small allowance [HSL 268, 5: petition; HSSPMB: 164], and although he had no direct successor in business, the firm of Thomas Glen, (established 1827) bought several items from him shortly before his death, including "24 music plaits". [Glen Accounts Cannon 1980: 65]. The plates were for the light music collection which Glen republished in 1841. J. & R. Glen were later to bring out further

editions of the light music, and a final edition of the pibroch in about 1870. [Cannon 1980: 31-39].

Within 18 years of publication, MacDonald's pibroch collection was superseded by Angus MacKay's larger, simpler, better-presented and more richly funded collection, which above all, bore the authority of the Queen's piper. MacDonald undoubtedly suffered in having to break down barriers and familiarise the piping public with staff notation, graft from which MacKay himself was later to benefit. MacDonald's collection was nevertheless influential in its time. He published seven of the ten most popular tunes at the competition (see Appendix IV); and there are at least four tunes which feature in the competition records only after he had published them.(13)

In a letter of 1820 he was described as "the inventor of the gamut for the Great Highland Pipe" [Kilberry I: 12], and there is no doubt that MacDonald's approach to the notation of pipe music influenced all subsequent notators.



Fig. XII

ANGUS MACKAY. Queen's piper and piper to the HSL (1850-1854). Watercolour by Kenneth MacLeay. [Royal Collection, Windsor Castle]



(e) Angus MacKay (1813-1859) A Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd 1838

Angus MacKay was the talented son of a respected father. From humble beginnings in Eyre, Raasay, where he was born in September 1813 [MacLellan J.A. 1966: 10], he rose to become personal piper to Queen Victoria, and the very personification of the successful Highlander in Victorian Britain. His collection of 61 pibrochs, published in 1838, was a conspicuous success, being described by one twentieth century piping authority as "the pipers' Scriptures". [Campbell A. 1950(b): 9]. No new volume of pibroch was to be published for over thirty years, by which time MacKay's style of notation and playing had become firmly established as "the only acceptable language of pibroch" [Cannon 1980: 30], and was to form the model for all subsequent generations. MacKay's success derived in part from his own talents and authority; in part from the enviable reputation of his father as piper and teacher.

John MacKay ("Iain MacRuari of Eyre". c.1767-1848)

Angus' father John was piper to MacLeod of Raasay. He competed in Edinburgh only once, in 1792 (when he was 25), and won the prize pipe. [Cal Merc July 26 1792]. He had been an orphan herd boy in the employ of Captain Malcolm MacLeod, grandson of Iain Garbh of Raasay, who,

besides his notorious pro-Jacobite sympathies, was a piper. (One of his tunes, Prince Charles' Lament, is still played. [MacKay A 1838: 169]). Later in life Angus recorded in his own hand how

"Fir Eyre [Malcolm MacLeod] played the pipes and was teaching a young lad; my father used to overhear them and pick up his lesson and play the same on the moors while herding; and that on a fiadan Sialeasda [reed pipe] he was overheard by Fir Aire, who taught him and afterwards sent him to the college of the MacCrummens and to the MacKays of Gearloch ..." [MacKay A. MS 3756: ii-iv].

Given the dates, John MacKay was most probably instructed by Iain Dubh MacCrimmon, then resident at Borreraig in Skye [Grant I.F., 1959: 560], and Angus MacKay, son of the renowned Iain Dall, piper to Gairloch. [MacLean J. 1952: 295]. In Raasay John also had contact with Eliza Ross, orphaned granddaughter of John MacLeod of Raasay, who

"was so fond of piobaireachd that she acquired many of the longest pieces from the performance of the family piper, and was accustomed to play them on the piano with much effect." [MacKay A. 1838, Hist. Notes: 7].

She in fact included five of John's pibrochs in her collection of Original Highland Airs, compiled in 1812 [SSS: 3], and he in turn wrote a tune for her, "Lady Doyle's Salute", so-called after she had emigrated to India and effected a good marriage to the English baronet, Charles D'Oyly. [Cooke 1985: 2].



In 1821 it appears that the relationship between MacKay and his patron, James MacLeod of Raasay, was strained. In July of that year, in striking testimony to John's reputation, William MacKenzie, secretary of the new-formed Celtic Society, wrote to the HSS. MacKenzie explained that he had recently met MacKay:

"The fame of this man is too well known to require any praise from me. He is not satisfied with the treatment he is receiving, and as his abilities are unnoticed and his allowance so reduced that he cannot exist he talks as a last resource of going to America. To let this man leave the Highlands will bring deserved obloquy on those institutions who have it in their power to relieve one so capable of preserving in purity the strains of our beloved Ancestors, and in the event of his quitting his native land, we lose a treasure as he will leave none behind him worthy of being his successor." [Kilberry I: 18].

MacKenzie suggested that the various Highland Societies should join forces to establish MacKay as a piping teacher. Nothing came of this, but he was not, in fact, forced to emigrate, for on the death of MacLeod of Raasay in 1823, he was employed by Lord Gwydir at Drummond Castle near Crieff. The trek from Raasay was a long one, and an old employee at the castle recalled in later years how MacKay had arrived with his family on foot, their belongings in peat creels on two Highland ponies. [Meldrum R. 1951(b): 9].

John was then in his fifties, and was probably in his prime as teacher and composer. Of his nine compositions preserved by his son Angus, the one which is now most

widely played is The Lament for MacLeod of Colbeck. Of his pupils, besides his own sons, undoubtedly the most famous was John Ban MacKenzie, who first received instruction from him in Raasay in the early 1820's, when he was piper to Davidson of Tulloch. Later, in Perthshire, they renewed their acquaintanceship, for while John was at Drummond Castle, MacKenzie was head piper at nearby Taymouth. [MacKay 1838, Hist. Notes: 8; Meldrum 1951(a)].

Other pupils included Angus Cam MacPherson, progenitor of a famous Badenoch piping family, and Archibald Munro, piper to Glengarry [MacPherson A. 1955: 72; MacLean W., SA 1953/5/A3], and it was through these men that John's teachings and reputation were to be spread to a further generation.

On his retirement from service with Lord Gwydir, MacKay was provided with an annual pension of £10 by the HSL (from 1837 until his death in 1848), and retired to Kyleakin where his son Roderick and daughter Kitty were living. On his death an annuity of £5 to his widow continued until 1855. [HSL 268: 6, 18, 20 Receipts]. This pension, clearly, is further evidence of the regard in which John was held by the major patrons of piping during his lifetime. The status of his family is confirmed by the successful competition careers of all four of his sons (summarised in Table IV/(11)), and by the fact that they all found steady employment as pipers on major estates. Donald and James followed the family vocation in serving MacLeod of Raasay; Donald was the first to enter Royal

Table IV/11

## JOHN MACKAY AND SONS

	JOHN Snr. (c1767-1848)	DONALD (1794-1850)	RODERICK (1810-1854)	ANGUS (1813-1859)	JOHN Jnr. (1814-1848)
Years Competing	1792	1820-1823	1826-1832	1825,26; 1835	1829,35,44
5th Prize	-	-	-	-	-
4th	-	-	-	1826	1835
3rd	-	1820	-	-	-
2nd	-	1821	-	-	-
1st	1792	1822	1832	1835	-
	<p>Pre 1823. Piper to MacLeod of Raasay</p> <p>1823-c1837. Piper to Lord Gwydir, Drummond Castle.</p> <p>1837-1848. HSL Pension Kyleakin.</p> <p>9 children.</p>	<p>1820. Piper to MacLeod of Raasay.</p> <p>1821-c1829. Piper to RG MacDonald of Clanranald.</p> <p>1830-1850. Piper to the Duke of Sussex.</p> <p>(1845-1850. Piper to HSL).</p> <p>3 children. d. London.</p>	<p>c1826-1829. Piper to CC MacKay of Arisaig.</p> <p>1829-1832. Piper to James Moray of Abercairney.</p> <p>1838. Piper to MacLeod of Raasay. Later merchant in Kyleakin.</p> <p>4 children. d. Edinburgh.</p>	<p>1826. Piper to Lady Gwydir.</p> <p>c1829. Piper to Duncan Davidson of Tulloch.</p> <p>c. 1837-1840. Piper to Walter Campbell of Islay.</p> <p>1841. Piper to Lord Ward, Glengarry.</p> <p>1843-1854. Piper to Queen Victoria.</p> <p>(1850-1854..Piper to HSL).</p> <p>4 children. d. Dumfries.</p>	<p>1835. Piper to Sir Robert Gordon, Balmoral.</p> <p>c1838. Piper to Duke of Richmond.</p> <p>1844. Piper to CP Leslie, Invergarry.</p> <p>1845. With Admiral MacDougall of Dunollie in Hong Kong.</p> <p>Single. d. London.</p>

- Sources: (1) "Notices of Pipers". PT Dec 1971, Feb, March, June 1972.  
 (2) Mackay A. 1838: subscribers; MS 3756:ii-iv (genealogy).  
 (3) Campbell A. 1950(b):8.  
 (4) MacIntyre North 1880 II:34.  
 (5) Dalryell JG. Gen 374D:20.  
 (6) HSL Records.



Service, with H.R.H. the Duke of Sussex in 1830; but it was Angus who, with his appointment as Queen's piper in 1843, was to find most lasting fame.

Angus MacKay. Working Life

Prior to 1843 Angus served on four different estates of which we know. When he first competed in Edinburgh in 1825, a mere twelve-year-old, he was listed as piper to Lady Gwydir on the Drummond Estate. [Cal Merc July 11 1825]. Soon after this, in 1829, he was piper to Duncan Davidson of Tulloch, near Strathpeffer (for whom his father wrote a Salute) [Whyte 1904: 6], while by 1837 he was piper to Walter Campbell of Shawfield and Islay. [Campbell J.F. 1880: 4,5]. This period of employment ended amicably in about 1840(14), when Angus composed his only surviving pibroch, Farewell To The Laird Of Islay [PS: 267]. His stay at Islay House was instructive, for it appears that he had access to manuscript material left there by his predecessor, none other than John Campbell, keeper of the Nether Lorn or Campbell Canntaireachd. Campbell had died in 1831 [MacKay 1838: 13], and the canntaireachd volumes vanished from sight until re-discovered by Sheriff John Bartholomew in 1909. [Bartholomew: 1909]. It is evident, however, that Angus had access to what was probably an early draft of the Canntaireachd, for a manuscript in his own hand, watermarked 1853, contains four tunes which

unquestionably originate from that source.(15) [NLS MS 3754].

Angus' final estate appointment was at Glengarry, purchased in October 1840 by William Ward (Baron of Dudley and Ward), from a debt-ridden Aeneas Macdonnell of Glengarry. Lord Ward, although an Englishman, took to the trappings of the Highland lifestyle with enthusiasm, and hired MacKay as piper soon after his marriage to Mary Russell in May 1841. [DNB; Prebble 1963: 274; MacLellan J.A. 1966: 10]. J.G. Dalryell met MacKay at this time, and recorded his impressive credentials:

"MacKay is 28 years of age. He has gained a prize bagpipe no less than eight times from his superiority on the instrument; besides various inferior prizes for dancing and dress." [Dalryell Gen 374D: 20].

It appears that knowledge of his credentials and pedigree was widespread, for it was on the recommendation of the Marquis of Breadalbane, no less, that Angus was appointed piper to Queen Victoria in April 1843, aged only thirty. [Victoria 1868: 89; MacLellan J.A. 1966: 10]. By June 1843 he was ensconced at Windsor, and the Queen recorded happily in her journal:

"was agreeably surprised at 8 by hearing our new Scotch piper, whom Albert had ordered to walk before the palace without telling me anything about it. It put me in mind of Scotland ... The piper is called Angus MacKay". [Quoted by Campsie 1980: 19].

Further entries in the Royal journal provide a useful insight into the piper's duties at Windsor and in the



Highlands. MacKay developed a useful technique of writing tunes to commemorate major events in the Royal calendar: on September 10th 1852, for instance, he was to be found leading a band of seven pipers at the famous torchlight ball at Corriemulzie, near Balmoral, and on that occasion he doubtless aired his new piece The Queens Welcome To The Torchlight Ball at Corriemulzie; similarly, the laying of the foundation stone for Balmoral Castle on September 23rd 1853 was accompanied by MacKay, with his latest composition, The Foundation Stone of Balmoral Castle 1853. [Victoria 1868: 89, 95, 99; MacKay MS 3744: 40, 50, 52].

Whilst serving at Windsor, MacKay was also active in various of the London Scottish Societies. He was, for instance, a member of the "Club of True Highlanders", where he might have rubbed shoulders with the historian James Logan [MacIntyre North 1881 II: 33], and he performed at meetings of the HSL, initially with his brother Donald, and from 1850 (on Donald's death), as official piper and officer to the Society, with an annual salary of £15.15.0. [HSL 268: 18, 20, Receipts].

Sadly, in early 1854 he started to show signs of mental illness, and was admitted to the Royal Bethlem Hospital (Bedlam).(16) He had periods of remission in which he continued to indulge his musical talents (a good deal of his manuscript music dates from this period), and he actually wrote a tune to commemorate his plight, not a lament, but a jig - Triall Bhethlehem [MS 3744: 52]. In March 1856 he was moved to the Royal Crichton Institute in



Dumfries. He died from drowning in the River Nith, whilst attempting to escape from there in March 1859. [Dumfries and Galloway Courier, 29/3/1859].

#### Early Notation and the Published Collection, 1838

If MacKay's senior position in the piping establishment ensured that his work was treated with respect, a good deal of the success of his published and manuscript volumes undoubtedly derived from the quality and consistency of his work.

At the age of twelve he had already turned his hand to music notation, for in 1825 he received a small award of 5 shillings for music produced at the Edinburgh competition, which music was forwarded to London in early 1826. [HSS PMB: 38; HSL 268, 27: 4/2/1826]. This effort certainly impressed the secretary of the HSS, Charles Gordon, who wrote to his counterpart in London:

"I recollect the young boy Angus MacKay produced at last competition the best collection I had seen in MS of pipe tunes. He is the son of Lord Gwydir's piper, - and probably it would be well if you had access to this collection."  
[Letter Gordon/Wedderburn 16/11/1825  
HSL 268: Box 2].

Angus must have received his musical training whilst at Drummond Castle, possibly from a musician employed to teach the Gwydir family, with time to spare for the piper's son. A possible candidate (although the case is not

proven) was Duncan McKercher (1796-1873), a Dunkeld musician who published two volumes of fiddle music in 1824 and 1830. [McKercher 1824; Baptie 1894: 126]. A link between MacKay and McKercher is suggested by two factors: McKercher subscribed to a copy of MacKay's 1838 collection; and MacKay, in his light music manuscripts written in the 1850's, acknowledged several tunes to be from "McKercher Dunkeld". [MS 3756: cover page].

In 1833, having served some time with Davidson of Tulloch, it appears that MacKay was in London, possibly visiting his brother Donald who was in service there. It was at this time that Angus became interested in the manuscript produced by Angus MacArthur for the HSL, for in November 1833 the secretary of the Society was contacted by Robert Edmonstone (a member who occasionally adjudicated at the Edinburgh competitions), who had this to say:

"Some public spirited Highland pipers, finding that little or nothing is to be expected from any of the Highland Societies, have determined, ere it be too late, to make a collection of the piobrachds themselves - and two of those pipers, who understand music, are now at work noting down the tunes of a list of upwards of 120 piobrachds - the alphabetical list of which I have furnished them." [HSL 268. Letter Edmonstone/MacDonald 18/11/1833].

Edmonstone explained that one of the pipers was staying with him in London, and requested the loan of the Society's "packet of Highland piobrachds", which duly arrived two days later, containing the MacArthur manuscript, and five separate sheets of music. [HSL 268, 4: Letter



Edmonstone/MacDonald 20/11/1833]. The evidence strongly suggests that the piper involved in this transaction was Angus MacKay. Although his collection was not actually published until 1838, it was clearly in an advanced stage of production when the prospectus was issued in late 1835, (see below). The collection included one tune (The Highland Society of Scotland's Salute) which Angus acknowledged to be from "the original MSS in possession of the Highland Society of London" [1838: 148]; and also included a brief but detailed description of the way in which the manuscript was produced by MacArthur and MacGregor. [1838: 12]. These statements confirm Angus' intimate knowledge of the manuscript at this early stage. Later (post-1838) he was to index the manuscript, and indeed included seventeen tunes from it in Volume I of his own manuscript collection, all carefully acknowledged. [MS 3753]. The other piper involved at this stage might have been John Ban MacKenzie (there have been rumours to that effect, vide Scott J.E. 1965(c)), but no positive information has yet emerged on this question.

Possibly the most interesting point to emerge from Edmonstone's correspondence was the fact that the pipers were "noting down the tunes of a list ... which I have furnished them." [Edmonstone op. cit.]. There has been much speculation as to why MacKay failed to incorporate many classics in his published collection (such as The Lament for the Children), while including several poor tunes whose chief recommendation was that they had specific



clan associations. [eg. PT Dec. 1971: 18]. The likelihood is, in fact, that he was constrained in his choice of material by the HSL (or perhaps, by Edmonstone acting on its behalf), which was anxious to include tunes which would appeal to a wide cross-section of clan loyalties. Significantly, MacKay referred to himself as "Author of Clan piobrachd" in 1843, which lends credence to the notion that he was working to a prescribed formula of clan tunes. [MacKay A. 1843: 1].

In July 1835 Angus won the prize pipe in Edinburgh, and on the 5th of August issued from Drummond Castle the prospectus for his forthcoming music collection. This promised 60 pibrochs, detailed playing instructions, and historical and biographical matter on "the principal ancient pipers", to be published in February 1836. He declared that his main objective was to

"preserve in its native simplicity and purity the ancient music of the country, by furnishing a fixed standard for future performers." [MacLellan J.A. 1966: 11].

This was a rather presumptuous ambition on the part of a mere twenty-two year old, albeit a prize winner, and one suspects that this remark actually represented the objectives of the patrons of the project - those "best judges of performances on the Scottish Bagpipes" whose approval was advertised in the prospectus.

Although subscribers were readily obtained (246 in all, including 45 individual members of the HSL, and a block subscription of 10 copies for the Society),

publication of the work was mysteriously postponed for over two years. In an apologetic preface dated July 1838, Mackay explained that the delay was due to "an anxiety to render the work as perfect as possible", although whether the problem lay with the music or the prefatory matter is unclear. Some compensation was perhaps to be had from the fact that the published volume contained not 60 tunes as advertised, but rather 61, the bonus tune presumably being The Chisholms Salute, a contemporary piece written in 1836. [NLS MS 7451, 19: 3].

The Collection of Ancient Piobaireachd was an attractive buy. The tunes were attractively set out, and there was a wealth of historical matter written in the vein of Pennant (1774) and Ramsay of Ochtertyre (1784) which must have appealed to the antiquarian taste of the period. A good deal of this material was obviously not written by MacKay, who indeed acknowledged the help of "some literary friends who assisted him in researches for the historical portion of the work". [1838: preface]. The helping hand was most evident in the "Circumstantial Account" of the Edinburgh piping competition [15-20], which was gleaned from contemporary newspaper reports, clearly at the expense of some detailed library work; and in the short essay on "The Bapipe-History-Effects" etc. [21-22], which was highly redolent of the romanticism of the age. ("The Highland pipe has stimulated to heroism ... has melted the lion-hearts of sorrowing clansmen ... " etc.). This section also contained snippets from the major competition



speeches, such as Sir John Sinclair's remarkable revelation that the existence of a carved cherub playing the bagpipe at Rosslyn Chapel, with a book spread before it, was proof that "in an early age, the bagpipes were played, not by ear alone, but from musical notation." [Speech reported in Cal Merc Aug 3, 1822]. (The Societies were clearly very anxious to convince pipers that the use of staff notation was the way forward!)

Two other sections of particular value were the "Account of the Hereditary Pipers" [7-14], and a series of historical notes on 51 of the tunes in the volume. This material was an entertaining amalgam of factual history, and piper's lore, a good deal of which clearly derived from MacKay himself. Little of this matter had previously been published, and its value should not be underestimated.

Occasional editorial confusion attests to the involvement of more than one hand in the production of the volume. (MacLeod of Raasay's Salute, for instance, was attributed at one point to Angus MacKay, Gairloch; at another to his son John Roy.) The name most commonly linked with the historical portion of the work was that of James Logan (1794-1872), author of The Scottish Gael (1831), and contributor to volumes such as Mackenzie's Beauties of Gaelic Poetry (1841) and The Clans of The Scottish Highlands (1843). In a copy of the collection deposited by him in the British Museum in 1856, he inked in the words "by James Logan" by the historical material, and this assignation of authorship has been accepted by the

British Museum in its catalogue. [Cannon 1980: 25]. Certainly he had the credentials to write authoritatively on bagpipe history. He was an Aberdeen-educated scholar with a good knowledge of Highland matters. He spent most of his adult life in London, living by writing. He was a member of the Club of True Highlanders, and a founder-member of the London Gaelic Society, and in 1839, riding on critical acclaim for The Scottish Gael, he was appointed assistant secretary to the HSL. [Stewart A: 1876; MacIntyre North 1881 I: ix; HSL 268, 5: 2/4/1840]. Unfortunately this post was short-lived, for in March 1840 he suffered a nervous breakdown and was forced to resign his position. (Logan attributed his condition to having been hit on the head by a throwing hammer in his youth). [HSL 268, 5: 2/4/1840]. His association with the HSL at this time lends weight to the idea that he was involved with MacKay's collection, and it is significant that in clearing his desk after being dismissed, he made specific reference to "the copies of MacKay's piobaireachds ... a heavy parcel", which had been in his keeping. [HSL 268, 5: 24/4/1840].

The precise extent of the HSL's involvement in MacKay's collection has yet to be fully determined. The volume was dedicated by MacKay to the Society,

"whose patriotic encouragement of Gaelic manners and customs is so well known, and whose patronage, so generously bestowed on this work, confers so much honour, and is so gratifying to the editor". [MacKay 1838: preface].