

University of Cambridge
2022/23 Part II / Part III / MPhil ACS
Category Theory
Exercise Sheet 3
by Andrew Pitts

1. Show that for any objects X and Y in a cartesian closed category \mathbf{C} , there are functions

$$\begin{aligned} f \in \mathbf{C}(X, Y) &\mapsto \ulcorner f \urcorner \in \mathbf{C}(1, Y^X) \\ g \in \mathbf{C}(1, Y^X) &\mapsto \bar{g} \in \mathbf{C}(X, Y) \end{aligned}$$

that give a bijection between the set $\mathbf{C}(X, Y)$ of \mathbf{C} -morphisms from X to Y and the set $\mathbf{C}(1, Y^X)$ of \mathbf{C} -morphisms from the terminal object 1 to the exponential Y^X . [Hint: use the isomorphism (7) from Exercise Sheet 2, question 2.]

2. Show that for any objects X and Y in a cartesian closed category \mathbf{C} , the morphism $\text{app} : Y^X \times X \rightarrow Y$ satisfies $\text{cur}(\text{app}) = \text{id}_{Y^X}$. [Hint: recall from equation (4) on Exercise Sheet 2 that $\text{id}_{Y^X} \times \text{id}_X = \text{id}_{Y^X \times X}$.]

3. Suppose $f : Y \times X \rightarrow Z$ and $g : W \rightarrow Y$ are morphisms in a cartesian closed category \mathbf{C} . Prove that

$$\text{cur}(f \circ (g \times \text{id}_X)) = (\text{cur } f) \circ g \in \mathbf{C}(W, Z^X) \quad (1)$$

[Hint: use Exercise Sheet 2, question 1c.]

4. Let \mathbf{C} be a cartesian closed category. For each \mathbf{C} -object X and \mathbf{C} -morphism $f : Y \rightarrow Z$, define

$$f^X \triangleq \text{cur}(Y^X \times X \xrightarrow{\text{app}} Y \xrightarrow{f} Z) \in \mathbf{C}(Y^X, Z^X) \quad (2)$$

(a) Prove that $(\text{id}_Y)^X = \text{id}_{Y^X}$.

(b) Given $f \in \mathbf{C}(Y \times X, Z)$ and $g \in \mathbf{C}(Z, W)$, prove that

$$\text{cur}(g \circ f) = g^X \circ \text{cur } f \in \mathbf{C}(Y, W^X) \quad (3)$$

(c) Deduce that if $u \in \mathbf{C}(Y, Z)$ and $v \in \mathbf{C}(Z, W)$, then $(v \circ u)^X = v^X \circ u^X \in \mathbf{C}(Y^X, W^X)$.

[Hint: for part (4a) use question 2; for part (4b) use Exercise Sheet 2, question 1c.]

5. Let \mathbf{C} be a cartesian closed category. For each \mathbf{C} -object X and \mathbf{C} -morphism $f : Y \rightarrow Z$, define

$$X^f \triangleq \text{cur}(X^Z \times Y \xrightarrow{\text{id} \times f} X^Z \times Z \xrightarrow{\text{app}} X) \in \mathbf{C}(X^Z, X^Y) \quad (4)$$

(a) Prove that $X^{\text{id}_Y} = \text{id}_{X^Y}$.

(b) Given $g \in \mathbf{C}(W, X)$ and $f \in \mathbf{C}(Y \times X, Z)$, prove that

$$\text{cur}(f \circ (\text{id}_Y \times g)) = Z^g \circ \text{cur } f \in \mathbf{C}(Y, Z^W) \quad (5)$$

(c) Deduce that if $u \in \mathbf{C}(Y, Z)$ and $v \in \mathbf{C}(Z, W)$, then $X^{(v \circ u)} = X^u \circ X^v \in \mathbf{C}(X^W, X^Y)$.

[Hint: for part (5a) use question 2; for part (5b) use Exercise Sheet 2, question 1c.]

6. Let \mathbf{C} be a cartesian closed category in which every pair of objects X and Y possesses a binary coproduct $X \xrightarrow{\text{inl}_{X,Y}} X + Y \xleftarrow{\text{inr}_{X,Y}} Y$. For all objects $X, Y, Z \in \mathbf{C}$ construct an isomorphism $(Y + Z) \times X \cong (Y \times X) + (Z \times X)$. [Hint: you may find it helpful to use some of the properties from question 4.]

7. Using the natural deduction rules for Intuitionistic Propositional Logic (given in Lecture 6), give proofs of the following judgements. In each case write down a corresponding typing judgement of the Simply Typed Lambda Calculus.

- (a) $\diamond, \psi \vdash (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi$
- (b) $\diamond, \varphi \vdash (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi$
- (c) $\diamond, ((\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \varphi \Rightarrow \psi$

8. (a) Given simple types A, B, C , give terms s and t of the Simply Typed Lambda Calculus that satisfy the following typing and $\beta\eta$ -equality judgements:

$$\diamond, x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \vdash s : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \quad (6)$$

$$\diamond, y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \vdash t : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \quad (7)$$

$$\diamond, x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \vdash t[s/y] =_{\beta\eta} x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \quad (8)$$

$$\diamond, y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \vdash s[t/x] =_{\beta\eta} y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \quad (9)$$

(b) Explain why question (8a) implies that for any three objects X, Y and Z in a cartesian closed category \mathbf{C} , there are morphisms

$$f : Z^{(X \times Y)} \rightarrow (Z^Y)^X \quad (10)$$

$$g : (Z^Y)^X \rightarrow Z^{(X \times Y)} \quad (11)$$

that give an isomorphism $Z^{(X \times Y)} \cong (Z^Y)^X$ in \mathbf{C} .

9. Make up and solve a question like question 8 ending with an isomorphism $X^1 \cong X$ for any object X in a cartesian closed category \mathbf{C} (with terminal object 1).

University of Cambridge
2022/23 Part II / Part III / MPhil ACS
Category Theory
Exercise Sheet 3 – Solution Notes
by Andrew Pitts

Question 1 Recalling the isomorphism $1 \times X \cong X$ from question 2 on Exercise Sheet 2, define

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{f} &= \text{cur}(1 \times X \xrightarrow[\cong]{\pi_2} X \xrightarrow{f} Y) \\ \overline{g} &= X \xrightarrow[\cong]{\langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle} 1 \times X \xrightarrow{e \times \text{id}_X} Y^X \times X \xrightarrow{\text{app}} Y \end{aligned}$$

Thus

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{g} &= \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (g \times \text{id}_X) \circ \langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle \circ \pi_2) \\ &= \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (g \times \text{id}_X)) \quad \text{since } \pi_2 : 1 \times X \rightarrow X \text{ is an iso with inverse } \langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle \\ &= g \quad \text{by the uniqueness part of the universal property of exponentials} \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \overline{f} &= \text{app} \circ (\text{cur}(f \circ \pi_2) \times \text{id}_X) \circ \langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle \\ &= f \circ \pi_2 \circ \langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle \quad \text{by definition of } \text{cur}(f \circ \pi_2) \\ &= f \quad \text{since } \pi_2 : 1 \times X \rightarrow X \text{ is an iso with inverse } \langle \langle \cdot, \text{id}_X \rangle \rangle \end{aligned}$$

Question 2 By definition, $\text{cur}(\text{app})$ is the unique morphism $f \in \mathbf{C}(Y^X, Y^X)$ satisfying $\text{app} \circ (f \times \text{id}_X) = \text{app}$. But from Exercise Sheet 2 question 1c, we have $\text{id}_{Y^X} \times \text{id}_X = \text{id}_{Y^X \times X}$ and hence $\text{app} \circ (f \times \text{id}_X) = \text{app}$ also holds when $f = \text{id}_{Y^X}$. Therefore $\text{id}_{Y^X} = \text{cur}(\text{app})$.

Question 3 Note that

$$\begin{aligned} \text{app} \circ (((\text{cur } f) \circ g) \times \text{id}_X) &= \text{app} \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_X) \circ (g \times \text{id}_X) && \text{by Ex. Sh. 2, question 1c} \\ &= f \circ (g \times \text{id}_X) && \text{by definition of } \text{cur } f \end{aligned}$$

and therefore $(\text{cur } f) \circ g = \text{cur}(f \circ (g \times \text{id}_X))$, by the uniqueness part of the universal property of exponentials.

Question 4

(a) $(\text{id}_Y)^X \triangleq \text{cur}(\text{id}_Y \circ \text{app}) = \text{cur}(\text{app}) = \text{id}_{Y^X}$, by question 2.

(b) $\text{app} \circ ((g^X \circ \text{cur } f) \times \text{id}_X) = \text{app} \circ (g^X \times \text{id}_X) \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_X)$ by Ex. Sh. 2, question 1c
 $= g \circ \text{app} \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_X)$ by definition of g^X
 $= g \circ f$ by definition of $\text{cur } f$

and therefore $g^X \circ \text{cur } f = \text{cur}(g \circ f)$, by the uniqueness part of the universal property of exponentials.

$$\begin{aligned}
(c) \quad g^X \circ f^X &= g^X \circ \text{cur}(f \circ \text{app}) && \text{by definition of } f^X \\
&= \text{cur}(g \circ f \circ \text{app}) && \text{by part (b)} \\
&\triangleq (g \circ f)^X
\end{aligned}$$

Question 5

$$(a) \quad X^{\text{id}_Y} \triangleq \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (\text{id}_{X^Y} \times \text{id}_Y)) = \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ \text{id}_{X^Y \times Y}) = \text{cur}(\text{app}) = \text{id}_{X^Y}, \text{ by question 2.}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
(b) \quad \text{app} \circ ((Z^g \circ \text{cur } f) \times \text{id}_W) &= \text{app} \circ (Z^g \times \text{id}_W) \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_W) && \text{by Ex.Sh. 2, question 1c} \\
&= \text{app} \circ (\text{id}_Y \times g) \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_W) && \text{by definition of } Z^g \\
&= \text{app} \circ (\text{cur } f \times \text{id}_X) \circ (\text{id}_Y \times g) && \text{by Ex.Sh. 2, question 1c} \\
&= f \circ (\text{id}_Y \times g) && \text{by definition of cur } f
\end{aligned}$$

and therefore $Z^g \circ \text{cur } f = \text{cur}(f \circ (\text{id}_Y \times g))$, by the uniqueness part of the universal property of exponentials.

$$\begin{aligned}
(c) \quad X^u \circ X^v &= X^u \circ \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (\text{id} \times v)) && \text{by definition of } X^v \\
&= \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (\text{id} \times v) \circ (\text{id} \times u)) && \text{by part (b)} \\
&= \text{cur}(\text{app} \circ (\text{id} \times (v \circ u))) && \text{by Ex.Sh. 2, question 1c} \\
&\triangleq X^{(v \circ u)}
\end{aligned}$$

Question 6 The universal property of the coproduct $X + Y$ says that for all $f \in \mathbf{C}(X, Z)$ and $g \in \mathbf{C}(Y, Z)$ there is a unique morphism $[f, g] \in \mathbf{C}(X + Y, Z)$ with $[f, g] \circ \text{inl}_{X,Y} = f$ and $[f, g] \circ \text{inr}_{X,Y} = g$. Given objects $X, Y, Z \in \mathbf{C}$, from

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{cur}(\text{inl}_{Y \times X, Z \times X}) &: Y \rightarrow ((Y \times X) + (Z \times X))^X \\
\text{cur}(\text{inr}_{Y \times X, Z \times X}) &: Z \rightarrow ((Y \times X) + (Z \times X))^X
\end{aligned}$$

we get

$$[\text{cur}(\text{inl}_{Y \times X, Z \times X}), \text{cur}(\text{inr}_{Y \times X, Z \times X})] : Y + Z \rightarrow ((Y \times X) + (Z \times X))^X$$

and hence

$$i \triangleq \text{app} \circ ([\text{cur}(\text{inl}_{Y \times X, Z \times X}), \text{cur}(\text{inr}_{Y \times X, Z \times X})] \times \text{id}_X) \in \mathbf{C}((Y + Z) \times X, (Y \times X) + (Z \times X))$$

In the other direction, define

$$j \triangleq [\text{inl}_{Y,Z} \times \text{id}_X, \text{inr}_{Y,Z} \times \text{id}_X] \in \mathbf{C}((Y \times X) + (Z \times X), (Y + Z) \times X)$$

To see that $i \circ j = \text{id}$, note that

$$\begin{aligned}
i \circ j \circ \text{inl} &= i \circ (\text{inl} \times \text{id}) && \text{by definition of } j \\
&= \text{app} \circ ([\text{cur } \text{inl}, \text{cur } \text{inr}] \times \text{id}) \circ (\text{inl} \times \text{id}) && \text{by definition of } i \\
&= \text{app} \circ (([\text{cur } \text{inl}, \text{cur } \text{inr}] \circ \text{inl}) \times \text{id}) && \text{by Ex.Sh. 2, question 1c} \\
&= \text{app} \circ (\text{cur } \text{inl} \times \text{id}) && \text{by definition of } [_, _] \\
&= \text{inl} && \text{by definition of cur } _ \\
&= \text{id} \circ \text{inl}
\end{aligned}$$

and similarly, $i \circ j \circ \text{inr} = \text{id} \circ \text{inr}$; therefore by the uniqueness part of the universal property for coproducts we have $i \circ j = \text{id}$. To see that $j \circ i = \text{id}$, note that

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{cur}(j \circ i) &= j^X \circ \text{cur } i && \text{by (3)} \\
&= j^X \circ [\text{cur inl}, \text{cur inr}] && \text{by definition of } i \\
&= [j^X \circ \text{cur inl}, j^X \circ \text{cur inr}] && \text{by the dual of property (1) for products from Ex.Sh. 2} \\
&= [\text{cur}(j \circ \text{inl}), \text{cur}(j \circ \text{inr})] && \text{by (3)} \\
&= [\text{cur}(\text{inl} \times \text{id}), \text{cur}(\text{inr} \times \text{id})] && \text{by definition of } j \\
&= [(\text{cur id}) \circ \text{inl}, (\text{cur id}) \circ \text{inr}] && \text{by (1)} \\
&= (\text{cur id}) \circ [\text{inl}, \text{inr}] && \text{by the dual of property (1) for products from Ex.Sh. 2} \\
&= (\text{cur id}) \circ \text{id} && \text{by uniqueness part of univ. property of coproducts} \\
&= \text{cur id}
\end{aligned}$$

and hence $j \circ i = \text{app}(\text{cur}(j \circ i) \times \text{id}) = \text{app}(\text{cur id} \times \text{id}) = \text{id}$.

Question 7

(a) IPL proof tree

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\diamond, \psi \vdash \psi} \text{(AX)}}{\diamond, \psi, \varphi \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \psi} \text{(WK)}}{\diamond, \psi \vdash (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(\Rightarrow I)}$$

STLC typing judgement $\diamond, y : \psi \vdash \lambda f : \varphi \Rightarrow \psi. y : (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi$

(b) IPL proof tree

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\diamond, \varphi, \varphi \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \varphi \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(AX)}}{\diamond, \varphi, \varphi \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \psi} \text{(WK)}}{\diamond, \varphi \vdash (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(\Rightarrow I)}$$

STLC typing judgement $\diamond, y : \psi \vdash \lambda f : \varphi \Rightarrow \psi. f x : (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi$

(c) IPL proof tree, where $\theta \triangleq ((\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\diamond, \theta \vdash \theta} \text{(AX)}}{\diamond, \theta, \varphi \vdash \theta} \text{(WK)}}{\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{}{\diamond, \theta, \varphi, \varphi \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \varphi \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(AX)}}{\diamond, \theta, \varphi, \varphi \Rightarrow \psi \vdash \psi} \text{(WK)}}{\diamond, \theta, \varphi \vdash (\varphi \Rightarrow \psi) \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(\Rightarrow I)}}{\diamond, \theta, \varphi \vdash \psi} \text{(\Rightarrow E)}}{\diamond, \theta \vdash \varphi \Rightarrow \psi} \text{(\Rightarrow I)}$$

STLC typing judgement $\diamond, f : \theta \vdash \lambda x : \varphi. f(\lambda g : \varphi \Rightarrow \psi. g x) : \varphi \Rightarrow \psi$

Question 8

(a) $s \triangleq \lambda a : A. \lambda b : B. x(a, b)$

$t \triangleq \lambda c : A \times B. y(\text{fst } c)(\text{snd } c)$

Proof of (6), where $\Gamma \triangleq \diamond, x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C, a : A, b : B$:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\dots}{\dots} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma \vdash x : A \times B \rightarrow C} (\text{VAR}') \quad \frac{\frac{\dots}{\dots} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma \vdash a : A} (\text{VAR}') \quad \frac{\dots}{\Gamma \vdash b : B} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma \vdash (a, b) : A \times B} (\text{PAIR})}{\Gamma \vdash x(a, b) : C} (\text{APP})}{\diamond, x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \vdash s : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)} (\lambda^2)$$

Proof of (7), where $\Gamma' \triangleq \diamond, y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C), c : A \times B$:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\dots}{\dots} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma' \vdash y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)} (\text{VAR}') \quad \frac{\frac{\dots}{\dots} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma' \vdash c : A \times B} (\text{FST})}{\Gamma' \vdash y(\text{fst } c) : B \rightarrow C} (\text{APP}) \quad \frac{\frac{\dots}{\dots} (\text{VAR})}{\Gamma' \vdash c : A \times B} (\text{SND})}{\Gamma' \vdash \text{snd } c : B} (\text{APP})}{\Gamma' \vdash y(\text{fst } c)(\text{snd } c) : C} (\text{APP})}{\diamond, y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \vdash t : (A \times B) \rightarrow C} (\lambda)$$

Proof of (8) (not laid out as a tree):

$$\begin{aligned} t[s/y] &\triangleq \lambda c : A \times B. (\lambda a : A. \lambda b : B. x(a, b))(\text{fst } c)(\text{snd } c) \\ &=_{\beta\eta} \lambda c : A \times B. x(\text{fst } c, \text{snd } c) && \beta\text{-conversion, twice} \\ &=_{\beta\eta} \lambda c : A \times B. x c && \eta\text{-conv. at type } A \times B \\ &=_{\beta\eta} x && \eta\text{-conv. at type } (A \times B) \rightarrow C \end{aligned}$$

Proof of (9) (not laid out as a tree):

$$\begin{aligned} s[t/x] &\triangleq \lambda a : A. \lambda b : B. (\lambda c : A \times B. y(\text{fst } c)(\text{snd } c))(a, b) \\ &=_{\beta\eta} \lambda a : A. \lambda b : B. y(\text{fst } (a, b))(\text{snd } (a, b)) && \beta\text{-conversion,} \\ &=_{\beta\eta} \lambda a : A. \lambda b : B. y a b && \beta\text{-conversion, twice} \\ &=_{\beta\eta} \lambda a : A. y a && \eta\text{-conv. at type } B \rightarrow C \\ &=_{\beta\eta} y && \eta\text{-conv. at type } A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \end{aligned}$$

(b) In part (8a), if we take A, B, C to be ground types that are interpreted in \mathbf{C} by the objects X, Y, Z , then the interpretations of (6) and (7) give morphisms

$$\begin{aligned} f &\triangleq \left(Z^{X \times Y} \cong 1 \times Z^{X \times Y} \xrightarrow{M[\diamond, x : (A \times B) \rightarrow C \vdash s : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)]} (Z^Y)^X \right) \\ g &\triangleq \left((Z^Y)^X \cong 1 \times (Z^Y)^X \xrightarrow{M[\diamond, y : A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C) \vdash t : (A \times B) \rightarrow C]} Z^{X \times Y} \right) \end{aligned}$$

with the required domains and codomains. Furthermore, by the semantics of substitution and the Soundness Theorem for STLC, (8) implies

$$\begin{aligned}
g \circ f &= \left(Z^{X \times Y} \cong 1 \times Z^{X \times Y} \xrightarrow{M[\diamond, x: (AxB) \rightarrow C + t[s/y]: (AxB) \rightarrow C]} Z^{X \times Y} \right) \\
&= \left(Z^{X \times Y} \cong 1 \times Z^{X \times Y} \xrightarrow{M[\diamond, x: (AxB) \rightarrow C + x: (AxB) \rightarrow C]} Z^{X \times Y} \right) \\
&= \left(Z^{X \times Y} \cong 1 \times Z^{X \times Y} \xrightarrow{\pi_2} Z^{X \times Y} \right) \\
&= \text{id}_{Z^{(X \times Y)}}
\end{aligned}$$

and similarly (9) implies $f \circ g = \text{id}_{(Z^Y)^X}$.

For the record, f and g can be described using the structure of a cartesian closed category as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
f &\triangleq \text{cur} \left(\text{cur} \left((Z^{(X \times Y)} \times X) \times Y \xrightarrow{\langle \pi_1 \circ \pi_1, \langle \pi_2 \circ \pi_1, \pi_2 \rangle \rangle} Z^{(X \times Y)} \times (X \times Y) \xrightarrow{\text{app}} Z \right) \right) \\
g &\triangleq \text{cur} \left((Z^Y)^X \times (X \times Y) \xrightarrow{\langle \langle \pi_1, \pi_1 \circ \pi_2 \rangle, \pi_2 \circ \pi_2 \rangle} ((Z^Y)^X \times X) \times Y \xrightarrow{\text{app} \times \text{id}_Y} Z^Y \times Y \xrightarrow{\text{app}} Z \right)
\end{aligned}$$

However, it is quite tedious to use these descriptions to verify that f and g are mutually inverse.

Question 9 The STLC terms you need to use are

$$\begin{aligned}
\diamond, x : \text{unit} \rightarrow A \vdash x () : A \\
\diamond, y : A \vdash \lambda z : \text{unit}. y : \text{unit} \rightarrow A
\end{aligned}$$